



0

Gradients in plasma lead to unwanted turbulence



Global Gyrokinetic Simulation of

Turbulence in ASDEX Upgrade



gene.rzg.mpg.de

Density and temperature gradients:

Turbulence!

Wendelstein 7-X: 1Bn EUR

Reactor-sized: 20 Bn EUR



Turbulence as bottleneck – reduce turbulence – build smarter, not larger

Fluctuations in fusion plasmas

- Observed features:
- Everything fluctuates (n, Te, Ti, electromagnetic fields)
- Fluctuation levels tend to be small $-\frac{\tilde{n}}{n} \approx 0.1 \dots 1\%$
- Fluctuation frequencies: 10 1000s kHz are smaller than the gyrofrequencies
- Perpendicular fluctuation scales much smaller than the system size on the order of the gyroradius
- Fluctuations extended along the field lines

Can't use MHD, but allows the use of gyrokinetics!







The kinetic equation – a continuity equation of the distribution in 6D phase space

- Kinetic description intermediate step between fluid description and resolving single-particle dynamics
- Describe evolution of particles in terms of distribution function *f_a* of particles in 6D phase space z (3D real space x, 3D velocity space v)

$$\frac{\partial f_a}{\partial t} + \nabla_{\mathbf{z}} \left(\dot{\mathbf{z}} f_a \right) = C_a(f_a), \qquad \dot{\mathbf{z}} = \left(\dot{\mathbf{x}}, \dot{\mathbf{v}} \right)$$

of particles

$$\dot{\mathbf{z}}(\mathbf{z})f(\mathbf{z})$$
 $\dot{\overline{\partial}}f(\mathbf{z})$
 $\dot{\overline{\partial}}f(\mathbf{z})$

$$\dot{\mathbf{v}} = \frac{e_a}{m_a} (\mathbf{E} + \mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}) \quad \nabla_{\mathbf{x}} \cdot \mathbf{v} = 0 \quad \nabla_{\mathbf{v}} \cdot (\mathbf{E} + \mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}) = 0$$

$$\frac{\partial f_a}{\partial t} + \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla_{\mathbf{x}} f_a + \frac{e_a}{m_a} \left(\mathbf{E} + \mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B} \right) \cdot \nabla_{\mathbf{v}} f_a = C_a(f_a)$$

The kinetic equation... now in more convenient coordinates

$$\frac{\partial f_a}{\partial t} + \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla_{\mathbf{x}} f_a + \frac{e_a}{m_a} \left(\mathbf{E} + \mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B} \right) \cdot \nabla_{\mathbf{v}} f_a = C_a(f_a)$$

- Freedom in choosing suitable coordinates for ${\boldsymbol x}$ and ${\boldsymbol v}$
- Make use of coordinates related to the gyromotion:
 - Gyro angle
 - Energy

• Magnetic moment
$$\mu = \frac{m_a v_{\perp}^2}{2B}$$

 ϑ

Gyro-centre

 $\mathbf{R} = \mathbf{r} + \frac{\hat{\mathbf{b}} \times \mathbf{v}}{\mathbf{O}}$

 ${\cal E}={m_av^2\over 2}+e_a\phi$

$$\frac{\partial f_a}{\partial t} + \dot{\mathbf{R}} \cdot \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mathbf{R}} + \dot{\vartheta} \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \vartheta} + \dot{\mathcal{E}} \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mathcal{E}} + \dot{\mu} \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mu} = C_a$$





The kinetic equation in more convenient coordinates cont'd



We can simplify:

 $\dot{\vartheta} \simeq -\Omega_a$

$$m_a \dot{\mathbf{v}} = e_a \left(\mathbf{E} + \mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B} \right)$$

$$\begin{split} \dot{\mathcal{E}} &= \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left(\frac{m_a v^2}{2} \right) + e_a \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t_{\mathbf{r}}} \right) + e_a \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial \mathbf{r}} \cdot \frac{\mathrm{d}\mathbf{r}}{\mathrm{d}t} \\ &= m_a \dot{\mathbf{v}} \cdot \mathbf{v} + e_a \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t_{\mathbf{r}}} \right) + e_a \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla \phi \\ &= -e_a \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla \phi + e_a \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t_{\mathbf{r}}} \right) + e_a \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla \phi \\ &= e_a \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} \right)_{\mathbf{r}} \end{split}$$

Simplifying the kinetic equation some more



We decompose the distribution function $f_a = f_{a0} + g_{a}$, f_{a0} equilibrium function including adiabatic responses to small electric fields $\propto -e_a \phi / T_{a}$, g_a Small non-adiabatic part with $g_a \ll f_{a0}$

Assumptions:

- Equilibrium varies slowly in time c.f. perturbed part
- But allow $\nabla g_a \sim \nabla f_{a0}$.

$$\frac{\partial g_a}{\partial t} \gtrsim \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial t}$$

• And further: small perturbations in electrostatic field, equilibrium length scales L large compared with gyroradius, frequencies of instabilities w small compared with gyrofrequency:

$$\frac{e_a\phi}{T_a}\sim\frac{\rho}{L}\sim\frac{\omega}{\Omega_a}\sim\delta\ll1$$

Your turn: ordering of the terms in δ



$$\begin{split} \dot{\vartheta} &\simeq -\Omega_a \qquad \dot{\mathcal{E}} = e_a \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t}\right)_{\mathbf{r}} \\ f_a &= f_{a0} + g_{a}, \quad g_a \ll f_{a0} \quad \nabla g_a \sim \nabla f_{a0}, \quad \frac{\partial g_a}{\partial t} \gtrsim \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial t} \end{split}$$

$$\frac{\partial g_a}{\partial \mathcal{E}} \ll \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \mathcal{E}}$$
$$\frac{\partial g_a}{\partial \mu} \ll \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \mu}$$



In lowest orders



Equilibrium is independent of gyroangle: $\partial f_{a0}/\partial \vartheta = 0$

In next order
$$\frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial g_a}{\partial t} + \dot{\mathbf{R}} \cdot \frac{\partial}{\partial \mathbf{R}} (f_{a0} + g_a) - \Omega_a \frac{\partial g_a}{\partial \vartheta} + e \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \mathcal{E}} + \dot{\mu} \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \mu} = C_a,$$

Now choosing the equilibrium to be represented by a Maxwellian

(follows from drift kinetics in lowest order, at high collisionality)

$$f_{a0} = n_a(\psi) \left(\frac{m_a}{2\pi T_a(\psi)}\right)^{3/2} e^{-\mathcal{E}/T_a(\psi)}$$
$$\simeq n_a(\psi) \left(\frac{m_a}{2\pi T_a(\psi)}\right)^{3/2} e^{-m_a v^2/2T_a(\psi)} \left(1 - \frac{e_a \phi}{T_a}\right)$$

• Note:

density n and temperature T are assumed to be flux quantities with flux label ψ

• Then: $\frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial t} = 0$ $\frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \mu} = 0$ $\frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \mathcal{E}} = -3$

Splitting the movement into parallel and gyro motion



Assuming the particle mostly moves along the field $\dot{\mathbf{R}} = v_{\parallel} \hat{\mathbf{b}} + \mathcal{O}(\delta v_T)$

We obtain
$$\frac{\partial g_a}{\partial t} + \dot{\mathbf{R}} \cdot \frac{\partial}{\partial \mathbf{R}} (f_{a0} + g_a) - \Omega \frac{\partial g_a}{\partial \vartheta} - \frac{e}{T} \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} \right)_{\mathbf{r}} f_{a0} = C_a$$

All terms are of order $\mathcal{O}(\delta \omega f_{a0})$ with $\omega \sim v_T/L$, except $\Omega \frac{\partial g_a}{\partial \vartheta} \sim \omega f_{a0}$ as largest term

We can thus expand $g_a = g_{a0} + g_{a1} + \dots$ yielding in lowest order $\Omega \frac{\partial g_{a0}}{\partial \vartheta} = 0$ In next order after gyroaveraging hile keeping the gyro centre constant

$$\frac{\partial g_{a0}}{\partial t} + \langle \dot{\mathbf{R}} \rangle_{\mathbf{R}} \cdot \frac{\partial}{\partial \mathbf{R}} \left(f_{a0} + g_{a0} \right) - \frac{e_a}{T_a} \left\langle \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} \right)_{\mathbf{r}} \right\rangle_{\mathbf{R}} f_{a0} = \langle C_a \rangle_{\mathbf{R}}.$$

Averaging out the fast gyromotion



• Magnetic field \rightarrow reduction to 5D phase space



Image source: Garbet et al. Nucl. Fusion (2010).

Splitting the velocity



Splitting the velocity:
$$\langle \dot{\mathbf{R}} \rangle_{\mathbf{R}} = \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint \dot{\mathbf{R}} \, \mathrm{d}\vartheta = v_{\parallel} \hat{\mathbf{b}} + \mathbf{v}_E + \mathbf{v}_d, \qquad \mathbf{v}_E = \frac{\hat{\mathbf{b}} \times \nabla \langle \phi \rangle_{\mathbf{R}}}{B} \\ \mathbf{v}_{da} = \frac{\hat{\mathbf{b}}}{\Omega_a} \times \left(\frac{v_{\perp}^2}{2} \nabla \ln B + v_{\parallel}^2 \kappa \right)$$

Using that f_{a0} is a flux function and thus does not vary along the field lines $\mathbf{b} \cdot \nabla f_{a0} = 0$,

$$\frac{\partial g_{a0}}{\partial t} + \left(v_{\parallel} \hat{\mathbf{b}} + \underbrace{\mathbf{v}_{E}}_{A} + \mathbf{v}_{d} \right) \cdot \nabla g_{a0} - \langle C \rangle_{\mathbf{R}} = - \left(\mathbf{v}_{E} + \underbrace{\mathbf{v}_{d}}_{B} \right) \cdot \nabla f_{a0} + \frac{e}{T} \left\langle \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} \right)_{\mathbf{r}} \right\rangle_{\mathbf{R}} f_{a0}$$

nonlinear

Neoclassical response

Executing the gyroaverages: $\frac{e}{T} \left\langle \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t}\right) \right\rangle_{T} f_{a0}$



Have slow variation along the field but fast across it, can write: $\phi(\mathbf{r}, t) = \hat{\phi}(\mathbf{r}, \omega)e^{i(S(\mathbf{r})/\delta - \omega t)}$ Define $\mathbf{k}_{\perp} = \frac{\nabla S}{\delta}$ with $k_{\perp} \rho = \mathcal{O}(1)$

Fast variation

Slowly varying

Ballooning transform allows assumption of $\nabla_{\parallel}S = 0$.

Then
$$\left\langle \left(\frac{\partial\phi}{\partial t}\right)_{\mathbf{r}}\right\rangle_{\mathbf{R}} = -i\omega\left\langle\phi(\mathbf{R}+\boldsymbol{\rho})\right\rangle_{\mathbf{R}} \simeq -i\omega\hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R})e^{-i\omega t}\left\langle e^{iS(\mathbf{R}+\boldsymbol{\rho})/\delta}\right\rangle_{\mathbf{R}}$$

where $\left\langle e^{iS(\mathbf{R}+\boldsymbol{\rho})/\delta}\right\rangle_{\mathbf{R}} \simeq e^{iS(\mathbf{R}/\delta)}\left\langle e^{i\mathbf{k}_{\perp}\cdot\boldsymbol{\rho}}\right\rangle_{\mathbf{R}} = J_0\left(\frac{k_{\perp}\upsilon_{\perp}}{\Omega_a}\right)e^{iS(\mathbf{R}/\delta)}$

So that
$$\left\langle \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t}\right)_{\mathbf{r}} \right\rangle_{\mathbf{R}} = -i\omega J_0 \left(\frac{k_{\perp}v_{\perp}}{\Omega_a}\right) \phi(\mathbf{R},t)$$

Bessel function of zeroth order

$$\int_0^{2\pi} e^{ix\sin\vartheta} \,\mathrm{d}\vartheta = \int_0^{2\pi} \cos(x\sin\vartheta) \,\mathrm{d}\vartheta = 2\pi J_0(x)$$

Executing the gyroaverages $-\mathbf{v}_E \cdot \nabla f_{a0} = -\frac{\hat{\mathbf{b}} \times \nabla \langle \phi \rangle_{\mathbf{R}}}{B} \cdot \nabla f_{a0} = \frac{\nabla \langle \phi \rangle_{\mathbf{R}}}{B} \cdot \hat{\mathbf{b}} \times \nabla f_{a0}.$



$$\begin{split} \nabla \langle \phi \rangle_{\mathbf{R}} &= \nabla \langle \phi(\mathbf{R} + \rho) \rangle_{\mathbf{R}} \\ &\simeq \nabla \left[\hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R}) \left\langle e^{iS(\mathbf{R} + \rho)/\delta} \right\rangle_{\mathbf{R}} e^{-i\omega t} \right] \\ &\simeq \nabla \left(\hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R}) e^{-i\omega t} e^{iS(\mathbf{R})/\delta} J_0 \left(\frac{k_{\perp} v_{\perp}}{\Omega_a} \right) \right) \\ &\simeq \underbrace{\hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R}) e^{-i\omega t} e^{iS(\mathbf{R})/\delta}}_{\phi(\mathbf{R},t)} i \frac{\nabla S}{\delta} J_0 \left(\frac{k_{\perp} v_{\perp}}{\Omega_a} \right) \quad \text{because } \frac{\nabla S}{\delta} \gg \frac{\nabla \hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R})}{\hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R})} \\ &\simeq i \mathbf{k}_{\perp} J_0 \left(\frac{k_{\perp} v_{\perp}}{\Omega_a} \right) \phi(\mathbf{R}, t). \end{split}$$

We thus obtain

$$-\mathbf{v}_E \cdot \nabla f_{a0} = iJ_0\left(\frac{k_{\perp}v_{\perp}}{\Omega}\right)\phi(\mathbf{R},t)\frac{1}{B}\mathbf{k}_{\perp}\cdot\hat{\mathbf{b}}\times\nabla f_{a0}$$

Simplify further with gradients in the distribution function

With f_{a0} being a flux function: $\nabla f_{a0} = \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \psi} \nabla \psi$

Magnetic field in Clebsch coordinates: $\mathbf{B} = \nabla \psi \times \nabla \alpha \quad \Rightarrow \quad \mathbf{k}_{\perp} = k_{\psi} \nabla \psi + k_{\alpha} \nabla \alpha$

Obtain
$$-\mathbf{v}_E \cdot \nabla f_{a0} = iJ_0 \phi \frac{\hat{\mathbf{b}} \cdot (\nabla \psi \times \mathbf{k}_\perp)}{B} \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \psi}$$

 $= iJ_0 \phi k_\alpha \left[\frac{d \ln n_a}{d\psi} + \left(\frac{\mathcal{E}}{T_a} - \frac{3}{2} \right) \frac{d \ln T_a}{d\psi} \right] f_{a0}$
 $= iJ_0 \frac{e_a \phi}{T_a} \omega_{*a}^T f_{a0}$

With
$$\omega_{*a}^{T} = \omega_{*a} \left[1 + \eta_a \left(\frac{\mathcal{E}}{T_a} - \frac{3}{2} \right) \right] \qquad \omega_{*a} = \frac{T_a k_\alpha}{e_a} \frac{d \ln n_a}{d\psi} \quad \eta_a = \frac{d \ln T_a}{d\psi} \left/ \frac{d \ln n_a}{d\psi} \right|$$



Final step: same separation also in g_{a0}



With $g_{a0}(\mathbf{R}, \mathcal{E}, \mu, t) = \hat{g}_a(\mathbf{R}, \mathcal{E}, \mu) e^{i(S(\mathbf{R})/\delta - \omega t)}$

Obtain
$$\frac{\partial g_{a0}}{\partial t} + \left(v_{\parallel} \hat{\mathbf{b}} + \mathbf{v}_{da} \right) \cdot \nabla g_{a0} \simeq \left[v_{\parallel} \nabla_{\parallel} \hat{g}_{a} - i(\omega - \omega_{da}) \hat{g}_{a} \right] e^{i(S(\mathbf{R})/\delta - \omega t)}$$

With $\omega_{da} = \mathbf{k}_{\perp} \cdot \mathbf{v}_{da}$

Leaving out terms A and B (nonlinearity and neoclassical response) and collisions

$$v_{\parallel} \nabla_{\parallel} g_a - i(\omega - \omega_{da}) g_a = -\frac{ie_a}{T_a} J_0 \phi \left(\omega - \omega_{*a}^T\right) f_{a0}$$

Suitability of gyroaveraging: small gyration





Gyromotion small compared with background: gyroaveraging allowed Important condition:

 $\rho_s \ll L$



Gyromotion large compared with background: gyroaveraging not allowed