





 $\bullet$ 

 $\bullet$  $\bullet$  $\bullet$  $\bullet$  $\bullet$  $\bullet$  $\circ$  $\bullet$  $\overline{a}$  $\bullet$  $\bullet$  $\bullet$  $\alpha$  $\bullet$  $\overline{\phantom{a}}$  $\bullet$  $\bullet$  $0<sub>o</sub>$ 

> This work has been carried out within the framework of the EUROfusion Consortium, funded by the European Union via *the Euratom Research and Training Programme (Grant Agreement No 101052200 — EUROfusion). Views and opinions* expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or the *European Commission. Neither the European Union nor the European Commission can be held responsible for them.*

 $\bullet$  $\bullet$ 

 $\sim$  $\sim$  $\Omega$  $\sim$  $\bullet$  $\bullet$ 

 $\bullet$  $\bullet$  $\bullet$  $\circ$ 

 $\bullet$ 

 $\circ$   $\circ$   $\circ$ 

 $\Omega$  $\sim$ 

 $\circ$  $\circ$  $\circ$   $\bullet$  $\circ$   $\circ$ 

## **Gradients in plasma lead to unwanted turbulence**

Global Gyrokinetic Simulation of

Turbulence in

**ASDEX** Upgrade



gene.rzg.mpg.de

Density and temperature gradients:

Turbulence!

Wendelstein 7-X: 1Bn EUR

**Reactor-sized: 20 Bn EUR**



#### Turbulence as bottleneck – reduce turbulence – build smarter, not larger

## **Fluctuations in fusion plasmas**

- Observed features:
- Everything fluctuates (n, Te, Ti, electromagnetic fields)
- Fluctuation levels tend to be small  $-\frac{\tilde{n}}{n} \approx 0.1 ... 1\%$
- Fluctuation frequencies: 10 1000s kHz are smaller than the gyrofrequencies
- Perpendicular fluctuation scales much smaller than the system size – on the order of the gyroradius
- Fluctuations extended along the field lines

Can't use MHD, but allows the use of gyrokinetics!





## **The kinetic equation – a continuity equation of the distribution in 6D phase space**

- Kinetic description intermediate step between fluid description and resolving single-particle dynamics
- Describe evolution of particles in terms of distribution function  $f_a$  o in 6D phase space **z** (3D real space **x**, 3D velocity space **v**)

$$
\frac{\partial f_a}{\partial t} + \nabla_{\mathbf{z}} (\dot{\mathbf{z}} f_a) = C_a(f_a), \qquad \dot{\mathbf{z}} = (\dot{\mathbf{x}}, \dot{\mathbf{v}})
$$

of particles  
\n
$$
\dot{\mathbf{z}}(\mathbf{z})f(\mathbf{z})
$$
  
\n $\dot{\mathbf{z}}(\mathbf{z})f(\mathbf{z}+\delta\mathbf{z})f(\mathbf{z}+\delta\mathbf{z})$ 

$$
\dot{\mathbf{v}} = \frac{e_a}{m_a} (\mathbf{E} + \mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}) \quad \nabla_{\mathbf{x}} \cdot \mathbf{v} = 0 \quad \nabla_{\mathbf{v}} \cdot (\mathbf{E} + \mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}) = 0
$$

$$
\frac{\partial f_a}{\partial t} + \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla_{\mathbf{x}} f_a + \frac{e_a}{m_a} (\mathbf{E} + \mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}) \cdot \nabla_{\mathbf{v}} f_a = C_a(f_a)
$$

## **The kinetic equation… now in more convenient coordinates**

$$
\frac{\partial f_a}{\partial t} + \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla_{\mathbf{x}} f_a + \frac{e_a}{m_a} (\mathbf{E} + \mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}) \cdot \nabla_{\mathbf{v}} f_a = C_a(f_a)
$$

- Freedom in choosing suitable coordinates for **x** and **v**
- Make use of coordinates related to the gyromotion:
	- Gyro angle
	- Energy

• Magnetic moment 
$$
\mu = \frac{m_a v_\perp^2}{2B}
$$

 $\mathcal{E} = \frac{m_a v^2}{2} + e_a \phi$ 

 $\vartheta$ 

• Gyro-centre 
$$
\mathbf{R} = \mathbf{r} + \frac{\mathbf{\hat{b}} \times \mathbf{v}}{\Omega_a}
$$

$$
\frac{\partial f_a}{\partial t} + \dot{\mathbf{R}} \cdot \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mathbf{R}} + \dot{\mathbf{\hat{v}}} \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mathbf{\hat{v}}} + \dot{\mathbf{\hat{z}}} \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mathbf{\hat{z}}} + \dot{\mathbf{\hat{\mu}}} \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mathbf{\hat{\mu}}} = C_a
$$





## **The kinetic equation in more convenient coordinates cont'd**



We can simplify:

 $\dot{\vartheta} \simeq -\Omega_a$ 

$$
m_a\dot{\mathbf{v}}=e_a\left(\mathbf{E}+\mathbf{v}\times\mathbf{B}\right)
$$

$$
\dot{\mathcal{E}} = \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left( \frac{m_a v^2}{2} \right) + e_a \left( \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t_r} \right) + e_a \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial r} \cdot \frac{\mathrm{d}t}{\mathrm{d}t}
$$
\n
$$
= m_a \dot{\mathbf{v}} \cdot \mathbf{v} + e_a \left( \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t_r} \right) + e_a \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla \phi
$$
\n
$$
= -e_a \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla \phi + e_a \left( \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t_r} \right) + e_a \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla \phi
$$
\n
$$
= e_a \left( \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} \right)_r
$$

## **Simplifying the kinetic equation some more**



We decompose the distribution function  $f_a = f_{a0} + g_a$ 

 $f_{a0}$  equilibrium function including adiabatic responses to small electric fields  $\propto -e_a\phi/T_a$  $g_a$  Small non-adiabatic part with  $g_a \ll f_{a0}$ 

Assumptions:

- Equilibrium varies slowly in time c.f. perturbed part
- But allow  $\nabla g_a \sim \nabla f_{a0}$

$$
\frac{\partial g_a}{\partial t} \gtrsim \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial t}
$$

• And further: small perturbations in electrostatic field, equilibrium length scales L large compared with gyroradius, frequencies of instabilities w small compared with gyrofrequency:

$$
\frac{e_a \phi}{T_a} \sim \frac{\rho}{L} \sim \frac{\omega}{\Omega_a} \sim \delta \ll 1
$$

## Your turn: ordering of the terms in  $\delta$

$$
\frac{\partial f_a}{\partial t} + \dot{\mathbf{R}} \cdot \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mathbf{R}} + \dot{\mathcal{V}} \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mathcal{V}} + \dot{\mathcal{E}} \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mathcal{E}} + \dot{\mu} \frac{\partial f_a}{\partial \mu} = C_a
$$

$$
\dot{\vartheta} \simeq -\Omega_a \qquad \dot{\mathcal{E}} = e_a \left(\frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial t}\right)_r
$$
\n
$$
f_a = f_{a0} + g_a, \quad g_a \ll f_{a0} \quad \nabla g_a \sim \nabla f_{a0}, \quad \frac{\partial g_a}{\partial t} \gtrsim \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial t}
$$

$$
\frac{\partial g_a}{\partial \mathcal{E}} \ll \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \mathcal{E}}
$$

$$
\frac{\partial g_a}{\partial \mu} \ll \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \mu}
$$



#### **In lowest orders**



Equilibrium is independent of gyroangle:  $\partial f_{a0}/\partial \vartheta = 0$ 

In next order 
$$
\frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial g_a}{\partial t} + \dot{\mathbf{R}} \cdot \frac{\partial}{\partial \mathbf{R}} (f_{a0} + g_a) - \Omega_a \frac{\partial g_a}{\partial \theta} + e \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \mathcal{E}} + \dot{\mu} \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \mu} = C_a,
$$

## **Now choosing the equilibrium to be represented by a Maxwellian**

(follows from drift kinetics in lowest order, at high collisionality)

$$
f_{a0} = n_a(\psi) \left(\frac{m_a}{2\pi T_a(\psi)}\right)^{3/2} e^{-\mathcal{E}/T_a(\psi)}
$$
  
\n
$$
\simeq n_a(\psi) \left(\frac{m_a}{2\pi T_a(\psi)}\right)^{3/2} e^{-m_a v^2 / 2T_a(\psi)} \left(1 - \frac{e_a \phi}{T_a}\right)
$$

• Note:

density n and temperature T are assumed to be flux quantities with flux label ψ

• Then: $\partial f_{a0}$  $\partial u$  $\partial f_{a0}$ 

## **Splitting the movement into parallel and gyro motion**



Assuming the particle mostly moves along the field  $\dot{\mathbf{R}} = v_{\parallel} \hat{\mathbf{b}} + \mathcal{O}(\delta v_T)$ 

We obtain 
$$
\frac{\partial g_a}{\partial t} + \dot{\mathbf{R}} \cdot \frac{\partial}{\partial \mathbf{R}} (f_{a0} + g_a) - \Omega \frac{\partial g_a}{\partial \theta} - \frac{e}{T} \left( \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} \right)_r f_{a0} = C_a
$$

All terms are of order  $\mathcal{O}(\delta \omega f_{a0})$  with  $\omega \sim v_T/L$ , except  $\Omega \frac{\partial g_a}{\partial \theta} \sim \omega f_{a0}$  as largest term

We can thus expand  $g_a = g_{a0} + g_{a1} + ...$  yielding in lowest order  $\Omega \frac{\partial g_{a0}}{\partial \theta} = 0$ In next order after gyroaveraging hile keeping the gyro centre constant

$$
\frac{\partial g_{a0}}{\partial t} + \langle \dot{\mathbf{R}} \rangle_{\mathbf{R}} \cdot \frac{\partial}{\partial \mathbf{R}} \left( f_{a0} + g_{a0} \right) - \frac{e_a}{T_a} \left\langle \left( \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} \right)_\mathbf{r} \right\rangle_{\mathbf{R}} f_{a0} = \left\langle C_a \right\rangle_{\mathbf{R}}.
$$

### **Averaging out the fast gyromotion**



• Magnetic field  $\rightarrow$  reduction to 5D phase space



Image source: Garbet *et al. Nucl. Fusion* (2010).

## **Splitting the velocity**



$$
\mathbf{v}_E = \frac{\hat{\mathbf{b}} \times \nabla \langle \phi \rangle_R}{B}
$$
\nSplitting the velocity:

\n
$$
\langle \dot{\mathbf{R}} \rangle_R = \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint \mathbf{R} \, d\theta = v_{\parallel} \hat{\mathbf{b}} + \mathbf{v}_E + \mathbf{v}_d,
$$
\n
$$
\mathbf{v}_{da} = \frac{\hat{\mathbf{b}}}{\Omega_a} \times \left( \frac{v_{\perp}^2}{2} \nabla \ln B + v_{\parallel}^2 \kappa \right)
$$

Using that  $f_{a0}$  is a flux function and thus does not vary along the field lines  $\mathbf{b} \cdot \nabla f_{a0} = 0$ 

$$
\frac{\partial g_{a0}}{\partial t} + \left(v_{\parallel} \hat{\mathbf{b}} + \underbrace{\mathbf{v}_E}_{A} \mathbf{v}_d\right) \cdot \nabla g_{a0} - \left\langle C \right\rangle_R = -\left(\mathbf{v}_E + \underbrace{\mathbf{v}_d}_{B}\right) \cdot \nabla f_{a0} + \frac{e}{T} \left\langle \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t}\right)_r \right\rangle_R f_{a0}
$$

nonlinear **Neoclassical** response

# **Executing the gyroaverages:**  $\frac{e}{T}\left\langle \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t}\right)_r \right\rangle$   $f_{a0}$



Have slow variation along the field but fast across it, can write:  $\phi(\mathbf{r},t) = \hat{\phi}(\mathbf{r},\omega)e^{i(S(\mathbf{r})/\delta - \omega t)}$ <br>Define  $\mathbf{k} = \frac{\nabla S}{\delta}$  with  $I$ Define  $k_{\perp} = \frac{\nabla S}{\delta}$  with  $k_{\perp} \rho = \mathcal{O}(1)$ 

Fast variation

Slowly varying

Ballooning transform allows assumption of  $\nabla_{\parallel} S = 0$ .

Then 
$$
\left\langle \left( \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t} \right)_r \right\rangle_R = -i\omega \left\langle \phi(\mathbf{R} + \rho) \right\rangle_R \simeq -i\omega \hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R}) e^{-i\omega t} \left\langle e^{iS(\mathbf{R} + \rho)/\delta} \right\rangle_R
$$
  
\nwhere  $\left\langle e^{iS(\mathbf{R} + \rho)/\delta} \right\rangle_R \simeq e^{iS(\mathbf{R}/\delta)} \left\langle e^{i\mathbf{k}_\perp \cdot \rho} \right\rangle_R = J_0 \left( \frac{k_\perp v_\perp}{\Omega_a} \right) e^{iS(\mathbf{R}/\delta)}$ 

So that 
$$
\left\langle \left(\frac{\partial \phi}{\partial t}\right)_r \right\rangle_R = -i\omega J_0 \left(\frac{k_{\perp} v_{\perp}}{\Omega_a}\right) \phi(R, t)
$$

Bessel function of zeroth order

$$
\int_0^{2\pi} e^{ix\sin\vartheta} d\vartheta = \int_0^{2\pi} \cos(x\sin\vartheta) d\vartheta = 2\pi J_0(x)
$$

## **Executing the gyroaverages**  $-\mathbf{v}_E \cdot \nabla f_{a0} = -\frac{\hat{\mathbf{b}} \times \nabla \langle \phi \rangle_R}{B} \cdot \nabla f_{a0} = \frac{\nabla \langle \phi \rangle_R}{B} \cdot \hat{\mathbf{b}} \times \nabla f_{a0}.$



$$
\nabla \langle \phi \rangle_{\mathbf{R}} = \nabla \langle \phi(\mathbf{R} + \rho) \rangle_{\mathbf{R}}
$$
  
\n
$$
\simeq \nabla \left[ \hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R}) \langle e^{iS(\mathbf{R} + \rho)/\delta} \rangle_{\mathbf{R}} e^{-i\omega t} \right]
$$
  
\n
$$
\simeq \nabla \left( \hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R}) e^{-i\omega t} e^{iS(\mathbf{R})/\delta} J_0 \left( \frac{k_{\perp} v_{\perp}}{\Omega_a} \right) \right)
$$
  
\n
$$
\simeq \underbrace{\hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R}) e^{-i\omega t} e^{iS(\mathbf{R})/\delta}}_{\phi(\mathbf{R},t)} i \frac{\nabla S}{\delta} J_0 \left( \frac{k_{\perp} v_{\perp}}{\Omega_a} \right) \text{ because } \frac{\nabla S}{\delta} \gg \frac{\nabla \hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R})}{\hat{\phi}(\mathbf{R})}
$$
  
\n
$$
\simeq i \mathbf{k}_{\perp} J_0 \left( \frac{k_{\perp} v_{\perp}}{\Omega_a} \right) \phi(\mathbf{R},t).
$$

We thus obtain

$$
-\mathbf{v}_{E}\cdot\nabla f_{a0}=iJ_{0}\left(\frac{k_{\perp}v_{\perp}}{\Omega}\right)\phi(\mathbf{R},t)\frac{1}{B}\mathbf{k}_{\perp}\cdot\hat{\mathbf{b}}\times\nabla f_{a0}
$$

## **Simplify further with gradients in the distribution function**

With  $f_{a0}$  being a flux function:  $\nabla f_{a0} = \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \psi} \nabla \psi$ 

Magnetic field in Clebsch coordinates:  $\mathbf{B} = \nabla \psi \times \nabla \alpha \quad \blacktriangleright \quad \mathbf{k}_{\perp} = k_{\psi} \nabla \psi + k_{\alpha} \nabla \alpha$ 

Obtain 
$$
- \mathbf{v}_E \cdot \nabla f_{a0} = i J_0 \phi \frac{\hat{\mathbf{b}} \cdot (\nabla \psi \times \mathbf{k}_{\perp})}{B} \frac{\partial f_{a0}}{\partial \psi}
$$

$$
= i J_0 \phi k_{\alpha} \left[ \frac{d \ln n_a}{d \psi} + \left( \frac{\mathcal{E}}{T_a} - \frac{3}{2} \right) \frac{d \ln T_a}{d \psi} \right] f_{a0}
$$

$$
= i J_0 \frac{e_a \phi}{T_a} \omega_{*a}^T f_{a0}
$$

With 
$$
\omega_{*a}^T = \omega_{*a} \left[ 1 + \eta_a \left( \frac{\mathcal{E}}{T_a} - \frac{3}{2} \right) \right]
$$
  $\omega_{*a} = \frac{T_a k_a}{e_a} \frac{d \ln n_a}{d \psi} \eta_a = \frac{d \ln T_a}{d \psi} / \frac{d \ln n_a}{d \psi}$ 



## **Final step: same separation also in**



With  $g_{a0}(\mathbf{R}, \mathcal{E}, \mu, t) = \hat{g}_a(\mathbf{R}, \mathcal{E}, \mu) e^{i(S(\mathbf{R})/\delta - \omega t)}$ 

Obtain 
$$
\frac{\partial g_{a0}}{\partial t} + \left(v_{\parallel} \hat{\mathbf{b}} + \mathbf{v}_{da}\right) \cdot \nabla g_{a0} \simeq \left[v_{\parallel} \nabla_{\parallel} \hat{g}_a - i(\omega - \omega_{da}) \hat{g}_a\right] e^{i(S(\mathbf{R})/\delta - \omega t)}
$$

With  $\omega_{da} = \mathbf{k}_{\perp} \cdot \mathbf{v}_{da}$ 

Leaving out terms A and B (nonlinearity and neoclassical response) and collisions

$$
v_{\parallel} \nabla_{\parallel} g_a - i(\omega - \omega_{da}) g_a = -\frac{i e_a}{T_a} J_0 \phi \left(\omega - \omega_{*a}^T\right) f_{a0}
$$

## **Suitability of gyroaveraging: small gyration**





Gyromotion small compared with background: gyroaveraging allowed

Important condition:

 $\rho_{\rm s} \ll L$ 



Gyromotion large compared with background: gyroaveraging not allowed